

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

JUDGMENT IN A CIVIL CASE

JAMES O'BRIEN

vs.

**CASE NUMBER: 3:07-CV-1153
(VEB)**

**MICHAEL J. ASTRUE,
Commissioner of Social Security**

Decision by Court. This action came to hearing before the Court. The issues have been heard and a decision has been rendered.

IT IS ORDERED AND ADJUDGED that the Commissioner's motion for judgment on the pleadings is GRANTED, Plaintiff's motion for judgment on the pleadings is DENIED, and this action is closed.

All of the above pursuant to the Order of the Honorable Magistrate Judge Victor E. Bianchini, dated the 31st day of March, 2011.

DATED: March 31, 2011


Clerk of Court

s/ Melissa Ennis
Melissa Ennis
Deputy Clerk
